



4000 North Central Avenue, Suite 800, Phoenix, Arizona 85012
602.771.5100 | 877.803.7234 | firstthingsfirst.org

Chair

Nadine Mathis Basha

Vice Chair

Gerald Szostak

Members

Gayle Burns
Amelia Flores
Rev. Dr. Darren Hawkins
Dr. Sherry Markel
Heidi Quinlan
Ruth Solomon
Helena Whitney

Ex-Officio Members

Hon. Diane Douglas
Superintendent, ADE

Michael Traylor
Director, DES

Dr. Cara Christ
Director, DHS

Chief Executive Officer

Marilee Dal Pra

September 28, 2018

Honorable Douglas A. Ducey
Governor
1700 West Washington
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Dear Governor Ducey:

Pursuant to Executive Order 2006-14 Consultation and Cooperation with Arizona Tribes, the Arizona Early Childhood Development and Health Board (First Things First) respectfully submits the agency's annual Tribal Consultation Policy Report.

First Things First recognizes the sovereignty of Arizona Indian Tribes and Nations and the importance of honoring that sovereignty through government-to-government relationships. FTF recognizes the need for Tribal Governments to have a strong voice in developing effective early childhood systems. In that spirit, I am pleased to inform you of our efforts to dialogue and partner with Arizona's Tribes and Nations during State Fiscal Year 2018.

Sincerely,

Marilee Dal Pra
Chief Executive Officer

Enclosure



TRIBAL CONSULTATION ANNUAL REPORT
July 1, 2017 – June 30, 2018

Agency Overview

The Arizona Early Childhood Development and Health Board, also known as First Things First (FTF), is a public state agency that exists to increase the quality of, and access to, the early childhood development and health system that ensures children enter school healthy and ready to succeed. Governed by a state board, FTF is a decentralized organization that engages diverse constituencies to accomplish its mission to serve as one of the critical partners in creating a family-centered, collaborative and high-quality early childhood system that supports the development, health and early education of all Arizona's children birth to age 5. The vision of FTF is that all Arizona's children are ready to succeed in school and in life. Since inception, FTF has partnered with tribes throughout the state. Tribes may elect to have their tribal lands treated as a separate region by the statewide FTF Board (currently, 10 tribes); or, tribes may elect to participate in the designated geographical region(s) in which their tribal lands are located (currently, nine tribes).

Tribal Consultation Activities

FTF's tribal consultation activities work to: strengthen tribal-state relations, promote tribal considerations in early childhood development, build awareness in tribal sectors of the importance of early childhood; and enhance coordination and collaboration. In fiscal year 2018, those activities included:

- Each year since 2009, FTF has met in formal consultation session with Arizona tribes. In FY2018, that consultation included the following topics: Enhancing Local Government-to-Government Relationships- Regional Tribal Consultation and Measuring the Impact of Early Childhood Investments. *A detailed summary of themes that arose at that consultation - and the actions taken by First Things First as a result – are included in Attachment A.*
- First Things First launched the Quality First (QF) Redesign Field test to understand the implementation and impact of component revisions to the QF model. To that end, FTF requested and received permission for early learning programs and home care providers to participate in the Quality First Redesign Field Test from five different tribes.
- The table below outlines additional tribal consultation activities conducted by FTF Tribal Affairs staff in this reporting period by goal area. This information does not include all engagement with tribal leaders at the local level by the FTF regional directors or councils.

Goal	Objective	Activity and Performance Measure
Strengthen Tribal-State relations	<ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Provide an overview about First Things First and the work of the region such as: funding plans; needs and assets assessment reports; and Quality First programs; research projects.2. Seek guidance and direction on the tribe's approval process.3. Seek tribal approvals in reference to program services and data collection activities.4. Facilitate site tours to build awareness of the importance of early childhood and the impact of early childhood investments in tribal communities.	<p>Tribal Consultation: 4</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• State Tribal Consultation, in which 14 tribes participated.• Regional Tribal Consultation in three regions, which included the Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation, Tohono O'odham Nation and the Navajo Nation. <p>Presentation to Tribal Councils, Agencies and Committees: 22</p> <p>Colorado River Indian Tribes Council; Fort Mojave Indian Tribal Council; Hopi Health & Education Committee; Gila River Indian Community Health and Social Committee and the Education Committee (x2); Gila River Indian Community Council; Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community Council; Salt River Pima-Maricopa Indian Community Education Committee; Havasupai Tribal Council, Hualapai Tribal Council (x3); Navajo Nation Human Research Review Board (NNHRRB); Pascua Yaqui Tribal Council; Pascua Yaqui Tribe Research Review Committee; Pascua Yaqui Tribe Education Oversight Committee; Navajo Northern Agency Council; San Carlos Apache Tribal Council; San Carlos Apache Tribe Health & Welfare Committee and the Education Committee (x2).</p>

		<p>Meetings with Tribal Leaders and Staff: 18 Arizona Indian Tribes and Nations Legislative Day; Cocopah Vice Chairman and Cultural Resource Director; Cocopah Vice Chairman and Head Start Director; Havasupai Chairwoman, Councilman and General Counsel; Hopi Education Director; Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians Chairwoman and Tribal Administrator; Pascua Yaqui Child Care Home Providers; Pascua Yaqui Head Start Director; Pascua Yaqui Social Service Director and Child Care Program Manager; Quechan Indian Tribe Vice President and Indian Child Welfare Act Specialist; Salt River-Maricopa Indian Community Special Project and Contracts Manager, Early Childhood Education Center Leader, and Early Childhood Education Center Assistant Program Manager; San Carlos Apache Tribe Councilman (x2) and Health Director; Tohono O’odham Chairman and Education Director; Quechan Tribe Chief Judge; Cocopah Vice Chairman and Councilwoman; Hopi Chief of Staff; and Ak-Chin Child Care Development Director.</p> <p>Site Tours: 2 Chinle Elementary School; St. Jude’s Food Bank</p> <p>Meetings with Tribal Stakeholder Organizations: 4 Arizona Indian Tribes and Nations Legislative Days, and State-Tribal Liaison Roundtable (x3).</p>
Promote tribal considerations in early childhood development	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Share information about FTF’s government-to-government relationships and working effectively with Arizona’s tribes. 2. Learn about other early learning and health care systems/programs/committees and their efforts. 3. Discuss and prioritize public health issues in tribal communities. 4. Ensure tribal perspective is considered by other. regional/state/federal entities. 5. Provide insight on FTF’s experience working with tribes on early childhood initiatives. 	<p>Meetings With Tribal and Non-Tribal Stakeholders organizations: 17 BUILD Equity Leaders Action Network (x5); ELAN Fellow Advisory Committee; John Hopkins Winter and Summer Institute; John Hopkins University IRB meeting;; Office of Child Care’s National Tribal Center on Early Childhood Development Tribal and State Coordination; Center for Excellence Infant Early Childhood Mental Health Consultation First Tribal Expert Work Group (x2); Heard Museum.</p>
Build public awareness in tribal sectors on the importance of early childhood	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Introduce FTF Staff to tribal/non-tribal entities. 2. Share an overview of FTF, provide updates on activities/events specific to tribal, geographical regions, and/or in Tribal Affairs. 3. Enhance understanding of tribal issues that may impact the provision of early childhood programs and services in tribal communities. 4. Share information on available grant opportunities. 	<p>Meetings with Tribal Stakeholder Organizations: 18 Arizona Early Childhood Legislative Day; Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation Education Director; Northern Arizona’s University’s Southwest Health Research Collaborative (SHERC) Advisory Committee; Hualapai Forum; <i>Indigenous Data Sovereignty: What Works</i> workshop presented in New Zealand; Waikato Tainui Raupatu Lands Trust; Flinn-Brown Civic Leadership Academy; FTF Tribal Gathering; Women’s Health & Wellness Conference; Arizona Advisory Council on Indian Health Care; ITCA Tribal Early Childhood Workgroup; and Tribal Focus Group Discussion facilitated by ASU.</p>

Enhance coordination and collaboration among partnering FTF entities, state/federal/tribal organizations and tribes	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Seek guidance in appropriately accessing data from state and federal entities. 2. Discuss FTF's tribal consultation process. 3. Share information relevant to working groups, opportunities for collaboration and future work sessions. 	Meetings With Tribal and Non-tribal Stakeholder organizations: 16 Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation Education Director; Arizona Advisory Council on Indian Health Care (x4); Cultural Competency Administrator at Health Choice Integrated Care; Executive Director of Inter-Tribal Council of Arizona (ITCA); Heard Museum Staff (x2) ; Child Trends; Governor's Office of Youth, Faith and Families Deputy Director; White Mountain Apache Tribe Education Coordinator; Tribal Consultation preparation with AHCCCS, ADE, DES, and DHS (x2); and Northern Arizona University Vice President of Native American Initiatives Associate Professor/ Applied Indigenous Studies and the Chair of the Department of Teach and Learning/ Associate Professor.
---	--	---

Recommendations From Tribal Representatives:

FTF will continue to build organizational capacity of regional directors, regional council members, grant partners and other tribal and non-tribal stakeholders to; 1) gain a better understanding of FTF's Tribal Consultation Policy and Tribal Data Policy; 2) better understand data collection procedures of specific data sets including methodology, source, and significance of data contained within the regional needs and asset (RNA) reports; 3) better understand specific and unique tribal data approval and collection procedures for tribal communities within their region; and 4) provide culturally responsive programming. This increased organizational capacity will help ensure that FTF staff and partners have the skills and knowledge needed to confidently and accurately address tribal entities and stakeholders with regard to FTF data collection, dissemination, strategic priorities and services provided.

Revisions to First Things First Tribal Government Consultation Policy:

First Things First recognizes and honors the government-to-government relationships that exist between American Indian tribes, the federal government, and state government. In accordance with Arizona Revised Statutes § 41-2051, a tribal Consultation Policy was developed and adopted by the statewide FTF Board in 2009. This policy was amended on December 6, 2017 to update language to reflect statutory changes at the state level, additions to the Definitions section to simplify reading and addition of language to reflect FTF's commitment to regional tribal consultation, where appropriate. A copy of current FTF Tribal Consultation Policy can be found at:

<http://www.azftf.gov/tribalconsultation/Documents/Tribal%20Consultation%20Policy-Bd%20Approved%2012-11-12.pdf>

Challenges Faced

FTF staff and grantees have encountered two primary challenges in delivering and providing services to children and families in Arizona's tribal communities. First, there are not very many evidence-based models for early education programs specific to tribal communities. This can result in concerns over whether the program will be culturally responsive to the communities' needs. It can also be difficult to find staff in early childhood programs with the cultural background and/or professional training/experience required to work with tribal families. Secondly, the geographic vastness of some tribal communities makes it difficult to reach many families or for families to access services. FTF has taken proactive steps to deal with these challenges and remains committed to on-going dialogue with tribal communities and continuous quality improvement of its programs to address the unique needs of young children living on tribal lands. While FTF has had great success scheduling Regional Tribal Consultations, it is important to recognize that it can be difficult finding the right time to schedule consultations. For questions or more information, please contact:

Candida L. Hunter, Senior Director of Tribal Affairs
(602) 771-5034, cahunter@azftf.gov

ATTACHMENT

A



**Tribal Consultation Summary Report
September 13, 2017
Phoenix, Arizona**

Pursuant to the First Things First (FTF) Tribal Consultation Policy and Arizona Revised Statutes section 41-2051, FTF convened a formal consultation session on Wednesday, September 13, 2017. The purpose of the consultation was to receive feedback on: 1) enhancing the government-to-government relationships-regional tribal consultations and 2) measuring the impact of early childhood investments.

First Things First is committed to meaningful consultation with tribes through which elected officials and other authorized representatives of the tribal governments have the opportunity to provide meaningful and timely input regarding the development of policies or procedures that affect Arizona's tribes, Native American children and their families.

The following summary reflects comments and questions raised by Arizona's tribal leaders and their authorized representatives/designees.

Participants

Tribal Leaders and Tribal Representatives:
Robert Miguel, Chairman, Ak-Chin Indian Community

Roland Maldonado, Chairman, Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians

Deal Begay Jr., Vice Chairman, Cocopah Tribe

Carmen Bradley, Vice Chairwoman, Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians

Keith Moses, Vice Chairman, Colorado River Indian Tribes

Russell Begaye, President, Navajo Nation

Dr. Bill Myhr, Education Director, Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation

Jonathan Nez, Vice President, Navajo Nation

Shan Lewis, Vice Chairman, Fort Mojave Indian Tribe

Yvonne Kee-Billison, Executive Assistant, Office of the President and Vice President, Navajo Nation

Edmond Tilousi, Vice Chairman, Havasupai Tribe

Christopher Bahe, Staff Assistant, Office of the President and Vice President, Navajo Nation

Carlos Powell Sr., Head Start Director, Havasupai Tribe

Francisco Munoz, Councilman, Pascua Yaqui Tribe

Alfred Lomahquahu Jr., Vice Chairman, Hopi Tribe

Mario Molina, Education Director, Pascua Yaqui Tribe

Emma Tapija, Councilwoman, Hualapai Tribe

Cody Hartt, ICWA Specialist, Quechan Tribe

Stewart Crozier, Councilman, Hualapai Tribe

David Reede, Health Director, San Carlos Apache Tribe

Verlon Jose, Vice Chairman, Tohono O'odham Nation

First Things First:

Nadine Mathis Basha, First Things First Board Member

Michelle Katona, First Things First Chief Program Officer

Vivian Saunders, First Things First Board Member

Kim VanPelt, First Things First Chief Regional Officer

Josh Allen, First Things First Interim CEO

Candida Hunter, First Things First Senior Director of Tribal Affairs

In addition, First Things First staff members, representatives from tribal departments, and staff from the Arizona Advisory Council on Indian Health Care and the University of Arizona were in attendance to observe the consultation.

Summary

In statewide consultations, First Things First received feedback from tribal leaders that it would be beneficial for more tribal elected officials to have an understanding of the importance of early childhood and more information about the impact that First Things First's early childhood investments are having in their respective communities. In addition, in order to continue to build local early childhood systems that meet the unique needs of their regions – including greater collaboration and maximization of resources, it would be beneficial for First Things First regional partnership councils to be familiar with the priorities of the tribes in their area and the tribe's efforts to improve outcomes for young children. In response to the feedback from tribal leaders, FTF piloted regional tribal consultation in several regions during calendar year 2017. During the statewide consultation, tribal leaders shared their experience of participating in the regional tribal consultation pilot. Tribal leaders provided their perspective on tribal consultation, expressed their support for regional tribal consultations, shared how it is conducted in their tribal communities and suggested approaches to convening regional tribal consultations and issues/topics to discuss. Some tribal leaders also expressed a desire for the tribe to have greater input on the membership of the regional council and funded strategies. This could perhaps be a topic for regional consultation with those tribes. Tribal leaders also stressed the importance of communication and shared the status of young children and families' challenges and successes in their communities.

At prior consultations, tribal leaders shared ideas of how to gather information for continuous quality improvement and suggested that FTF consider developing a Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) with tribes to request information for program improvement and evaluation purposes. Furthermore, FTF recognizes tribes are also interested in the outcomes of programs in relation to children and families living on their tribal lands and the need to track outcomes of children from birth to college. Tribal leaders shared their experience in tracking outcomes of young children. Furthermore, tribal leaders shared their perspective on MOUs, approval needed in order to collect data from tribal and non-tribal grantees providing services and information they are interested in to inform their work and decisions on behalf of young children.

Comments/Questions/Concerns/Recommendations on Enhancing the Government-to-Government Relationships- Regional Tribal Consultations

Summaries of the regional tribal consultations held are included in Addendum A.

To help inform the conversation for the tribal consultation, tribal leaders from Tohono O'odham Nation, Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation and Navajo Nation shared their experiences participating in the regional tribal consultations. Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose shared his perspective at the consultation. Fort McDowell Yavapai Nation Councilman Paul Russell and Navajo Nation Council Delegate Jonathan Hale shared their experience by providing written comments, which were shared by the FTF Senior Director of Tribal Affairs during the consultation.

- Vice Chairman Verlon Jose, Councilman Paul Russell and Council Delegate Hale stated the regional tribal consultation in their region were productive and beneficial and should be continued.
- Vice Chairman Verlon Jose shared their experience in preparing for the regional tribal consultation. Furthermore, the document they developed outlining the nation's priorities was approved by the Tohono O'odham Nation Legislative Council, Resolution 17331, and submitted as written comments to First Things First.
- Vice Chairman Verlon Jose, Councilman Paul Russell and Council Delegate Jonathan Hale shared that scheduling of consultation needs to occur with the tribe on a date which works for a majority of the different branches of government.
- Council Delegate Hale and Councilman Paul Russell shared that sometimes there's a challenge in sharing information at statewide and federal consultation because there are many tribes at the table and time restrictions. They also thought it was helpful to only have one tribe and one agency at the table to talk about priorities and to learn from the tribe.
- Delegate Hale shared it was important for FTF regional councils to learn and understand more about tribal processes to further enhance collaboration between the regional council and the nation.
- Councilman Paul Russell stated he appreciated FTF leadership in attendance but to be mindful that too many staff in the room may cause discomfort amongst tribal leaders.
- Council Delegate Hale shared that consultation usually takes place during working hours so we would have to consider how that affects tribal employees who also serve on the regional council.

Many tribal leaders and designees expressed their support for regional tribal consultations, shared their perspective on tribal consultation and shared how it is conducted in their respective communities.

- Colorado River Indian Tribes Vice Chairman Keith Moses would like to have a regional tribal consultation in the Colorado River Indian Tribes Region and shared they have their own tribal consultation policy.
- Tohono O'odham Vice Chairman Verlon Jose stated it can be time consuming facilitating regional tribal consultations in each region and to consider alternating between the tribes to determine when each consultation is facilitated.
- Ak-Chin Indian Community Chairman Robert Miguel stated it's important to have meaningful consultations. He also shared that having three members of their tribal council is considered true consultation.
- Cocopah Tribe Vice Chairman Deal Begay Jr. stated consultation can be difficult for smaller tribes

who don't have assistants to help with scheduling and that government-to-government consultations should occur between an entity's leaders and the tribal council. He also stated that one person can be directed to represent the tribe.

- San Carlos Apache Tribe Health Director David Reede agreed it can be difficult to get their point across at a statewide consultation. He added that the San Carlos Apache Tribe is supportive of the regional tribal consultation and indicated that perhaps consultation should occur with the full tribal council; consultation with one member of the council may not constitute true consultation for a given tribe.
- Navajo Nation President Russell Begaye emphasized true consultation leads to action; it happens because it's not just a requirement and that feedback is considered into the planning and work of the program. He also stated the regional consultation was beneficial because discussion was specific to the nation.
- Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians Chairman Roland Maldonado expressed consultation inherently suggests respect for tribal sovereignty.

Tribal leaders expressed that the tribe should provide input on who is appointed to the regional council.

- Navajo Nation Vice President Jonathan Nez stated FTF does not have a process where the nation can provide a recommendation for regional councilmembers as other state and federal agencies do for their various boards/committees and suggested the nation would like to have that ability. This person could also serve as a liaison. He also added that because the Head Start program is under the executive branch, it could strengthen collaboration.
- Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose also stated he agreed that the nation should have input on who is appointed to the regional council and/or state board. He also recognized that on the state and federal level there are sometimes challenges in finding someone to fill positions on boards and committees for various reasons.

Tribal leaders stressed the importance of communication and shared how partnerships have been developed and can be strengthened in their regions.

- Cocopah Tribe Vice Chairman Deal Begay Jr. stated that the regional council is open with the tribal council and they have built a good relationship. He also shared that the Cocopah regional director is part-time but it's a full-time job and that can cause turnover and they are trying to keep the director there.
- Ak-Chin Indian Community Chairman Robert Miguel stated the key to building relationships in Indian country is by communicating, keeping it simple and being in the community so others get to know you. It's important to not just work for the community but to be a part of the community.
- Navajo Nation Vice President Jonathan Nez stated First Things First can support the nation by supporting the baby contest held on the nation. He also stated that FTF needs to keep all branches of government informed.
- Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose stated that communication is first and foremost. He also shared he knows the regional director and the regional councilmembers.
- Pascua Yaqui Tribe Councilman Francisco Munoz shared that experience between the regional director and tribal council or administration is important. He also stated they have built a strong relationship with the regional director.

- Hopi Tribe Vice Chairman Alfred Lomahquahu Jr. stated it's important to know the regional director and communicating challenges to provide better services for young children.

Tribal leaders and designees gave suggestions of approaches to convening regional tribal consultation and suggested issues and topics.

- San Carlos Apache Tribe Health Director David Reede stated schedules can be a challenge and suggested coordinating with staff to help determine a time that best works for everyone's schedule.
- Navajo Nation Executive Assistant Yvonne Kee-Billison shared there needs to be discussion with parents and caregivers about suicide and domestic violence so they can be trained and have a better understanding of the situations.
- Vice Chairman Verlon Jose suggested a listening session the morning before a consultation for FTF and tribal leaders to listen to teachers, parents, grandparents and the community so they can contribute to the topics discussed. He also suggested working with the regional councils to determine what is culturally appropriate for each region.
- Pascua Yaqui Tribe Education Director Mario Molina shared that directors provide research and information to their tribal councilmembers and that it's helpful to work with their office so the department can better support their Chairman and councilmembers. He also stated that there are some things you only talk to amongst men, women and/or within cultural societies.
- Hopi Tribe Vice Chairman Alfred Lomahquahu Jr. stated we need to find ways to talk about challenging topics in order to make progress. He also shared it might be helpful to hear the perspective of individuals working with FTF and the tribes because they may have suggestions or unanswered questions; communication is key.
- Navajo Nation President Russell Begaye had several suggestions which included: work force development, especially for tribal members because of their acceptance by families. Tribal members understand the language and culturally sensitive issues; data sharing so programs can share information about best practices; discussing the needs of parents (grandparents raising grandchildren and single parents) and accessibility to families because of transportation and getting into their homes; develop agendas with people running programs to determine what should be discussed at consultation and how FTF is partnering with other entities. He also asked if it's possible to have a higher degree of control over First Things First programs on the nation and shared that for years BIA controlled everything and the nation is now operating many programs. Furthermore, he indicated that tribes should be consulted as assessments are developed, including understanding what families are saying about programs.

Several tribal leaders shared the status of young children's needs, challenges and successes occurring in their regions.

- Cocopah Tribe Vice Chairman Deal Begay Jr. stated it's the parents and community that teach and care for children and see their needs, they need encouragement and support. He also stated there is a challenge in reaching families and getting them involved with their child's education.
- Tohono O'odham Vice Chairman Verlon Jose stated that education begins at conception and there are grandparents who are caring for their grandchildren.

- Hopi Tribe Vice Chairman Alfred Lomahquahu Jr. stated there are many young parents who don't know how to parent and there are grandparents caring for their grandchildren and they need support.
- Navajo Nation President Russell Begaye shared that the Navajo Nation just partnered with a university in New Mexico for thirty-five Special Ed teachers at bachelors and master's level. He asked how FTF can support this effort and work with institutions, specifically this institution, because the nation consults with the university to provide guidance on what is taught in the curriculum.
- Navajo Nation Vice President Jonathan Nez stated he appreciates FTF is focused on young children and enhancing culture, tradition and language and that there also needs to be a focus on bridging the gap between the elder and youth generations. He also shared how the nation supported healthier choices during the Shiprock fair. Children were given basketballs, fidget spinners, volleyballs, etc. in exchange for candy.

Comments/Questions/Concerns/Recommendations on Measuring the Impact of Early Childhood Investments

Tribal leaders shared their experience of tracking outcomes of their children.

- Havasupai Tribe Head Start Director Carlos Powell Sr. shared they have challenges tracking children because of the different educational institutions their children are in. He also suggested FTF funds evidence based programs to support tribes in measuring outcomes.
- Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose stated they provide technical assistance and training to ensure students are monitored and they are working to improve technology in the nation. He shared they are collaborating with Quality First and Tohono O'odham Community College towards improving capacity and suggested state agencies continue to work as true partners with the nation.
- Cocopah Tribe Vice Chairman Deal Begay Jr. stated the regional needs and assets report has supported the tribe in tracking the outcomes of their children as well as the education department.
- Navajo Nation President Russell Begaye stated there are challenges of determining what data to track and the interpretation of the data and that consultation is necessary to determine this. Furthermore, the accuracy of data gathered and communication infrastructure are other challenges.
- Pascua Yaqui Tribe Education Director Mario Molina stated knowing what to collect is a challenge, but the tribe has identified indicators of what's important to the tribe, including children with special needs. They also work with their Lead Education Agency (LEA) to request data.

Tribal leaders shared their experience in developing MOUs that cover several years of data collection and/or access to existing data.

- Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose shared there are several levels of approval needed to establish an MOU with the nation.
- Havasupai Tribe Vice Chairman Tilousi stated there is mistrust of outsiders who are seeking MOUs because of past experiences. He also shared an MOU defines the type of data, how it will

be collected and used. Head Start Director Carlos Powell Sr. also shared there must be trust prior to establishing an MOU.

- Navajo Nation President Russell Begaye stated the nation has to negotiate waivers and that dispute resolution must honor the nation's statutory laws. He also shared there is inconsistency in the state level; the Governor will say one thing and the program another. One program will state you don't have to waive sovereign immunity and another will say you do have to waive limited sovereignty. He also asked how to work with the state so there are consistent interpretations of federal and state laws in implementing programs so funding and implementation of programs are not affected. He also expressed that MOUs must identify data ownership, distribution and access of data and how it benefits the nation.
- Ak-Chin Indian Community Chairman Robert Miguel stated MOUs must state what data is being collected by whom and ownership is imperative.
- Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians Chairman Roland Maldonado emphasized sovereignty and dispute resolution should be included in MOUs and that each tribe has their own systems.
- Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose, Colorado River Indian Tribes Vice Chairman Keith Moses and Cocopah Tribe Vice Chairman Deal Begay Jr. stated there should be no "blanket approval" because the tribe/nation needs to ensure protection of data, context and approval of data.

Several tribal leaders provided their insight on approval needed in order to collect data from tribal and non-tribal grantees providing services.

- Tohono O'odham Vice Chairman Verlon Jose and Colorado River Indian Tribes Vice Chairman Keith Moses expressed approval must be received to establish who is accessing the data, how the data will be used and protected and how it benefits their people. Vice Chairman Moses also stressed that context is critical to ensure the data represents the community.
- Tohono O'odham Vice Chairman Verlon Jose also shared that approval looks different for each tribe and if the information is not personally identifiable information, the nature of the information [type of data] requested may determine what type of agreement, if any, is needed for the nation.
- Kaibab Band of Paiute Indian Tribe Chairman Roland Maldonado stated there must be some type of agreement in place to know information is being collected and how it benefits the people.
- San Carlos Apache Tribe Health Director David Reede expressed data ownership must be established and discussion must take place with their tribal council. He also stated each tribe is unique and discussion needs to happen with their tribal leadership.
- Pascua Yaqui Tribe Education Director Mario Molina stated his department is responsible for establishing MOUs, data collection methodologies, knowing what data is being collected, monitoring and reporting to the tribal council. He also shared that because of history of historical trauma trust must be established and never broken.
- Navajo Nation President Russell Begaye stated aggregate data is collected in order to justify services provided and agreements are approved with entities before programs are provided. He also emphasized an agreement is necessary in order for tribal or non-tribal grantees to collect data to monitor their own program.

Tribal leaders and designees provided insight on information they are interested in to inform their work and decisions on behalf of young children.

- Tohono O'odham Nation Vice Chairman Verlon Jose stated the nation is interested in learning more about educational attainment of parents to determine what wrap around services are needed and the benefits of their young children attending early childhood program to help inform work and decisions on behalf of young children.
- Navajo Nation Executive Assistant Yvonne Kee-Billison shared tradition, culture and language retention are protective factors and suggested they be incorporated into programs provided by grantees.

2017 Tribal Consultation Follow-Up Action Plan

CONSULTATION TOPIC 1: Enhancing the Government-to-Government Relationship- Regional Tribal Consultations

Emerging Theme from Tribes in Attendance: Tribal leaders shared their experience of participating in the regional tribal consultation pilot. Tribal leaders provided their perspective on tribal consultation, expressed their support for regional tribal consultations, shared how it is conducted in their tribal communities and suggested approaches to convening regional tribal consultations and issues/topics to discuss. Some tribal leaders also expressed a desire for the tribe to have greater input on the membership of the regional council and funded strategies. This could perhaps be a topic for regional consultation with those tribes. Tribal leaders also stressed the importance of communication and shared the status of young children and families' challenges and successes in their communities.

Tribal Leader Feedback	FTF Action Items Resulting from Tribal Consultation	Status
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Many tribal leaders and designees expressed their support for regional tribal consultations, shared their perspective on tribal consultation and shared how it is conducted in their respective communities. 2) Tribal leaders expressed that the tribe should provide input on who is appointed to the regional council. 3) Tribal leaders stressed the importance of communication and shared how partnerships have been developed and can be strengthened in their regions. 4) Tribal leaders and designees gave suggestions of approaches to convening regional tribal consultation and suggested issues and topics. 5) Several tribal leaders shared the status of young children's needs, challenges and successes occurring in their regions. 	<p>The Tribal Consultation Policy will be amended to reflect FTF's commitment to Regional Tribal Consultations.</p> <p>Regional Consultations will be facilitated with at least three tribes per year.</p> <p>Regional Directors will communicate with tribal leaders during regional council recruitment.</p> <p>Regional Directors will continue sharing information about the work of the region and Tribal Affairs will continue sharing information including legislative updates and funding opportunities.</p>	<p>The amended Tribal Consultation Policy was approved on December 5, 2017.</p> <p>Regional Tribal Consultations were convened in the Coconino Region and Colorado River Indian Tribes Region. First Things First continues to reach out and work with tribes that have expressed an interest in regional consultations.</p> <p>Regional council recruitment is on-going.</p> <p>Communication from regional directors and Tribal Affairs is on-going.</p>

CONSULTATION TOPIC 2: Measuring the Impact of Early Childhood Initiatives

Emerging Theme from Tribes in Attendance: At prior consultations, tribal leaders shared ideas of how to gather information for continuous quality improvement and suggested that FTF consider developing a Memoranda of Understanding (MOU) with tribes to request information for program improvement and evaluation purposes. Furthermore, FTF recognizes tribes are also interested in the outcomes of programs in relation to children and families living on their tribal lands and the need to track outcomes of children from birth to college. Tribal leaders shared their experience in tracking outcomes of young children. Furthermore, tribal leaders shared their perspective on MOUs, approval needed in order to collect data from tribal and non-tribal grantees providing services and information they are interested in to inform their work and decisions on behalf of young children.

Tribal Leader Feedback	FTF Action Items Resulting from Tribal Consultation	Status
<ol style="list-style-type: none">1) Tribal leaders shared their experience in tracking outcomes of their children.2) Tribal leaders shared their experience in developing MOUs that cover several years of data collection and/or access to existing data.3) Several tribal leaders provided their insight on approval needed in order to collect data from tribal and non-tribal grantees providing services.4) Tribal leaders and designees provided insight on information they are interested in to inform their work and decisions on behalf of young children.	<p>FTF will develop an MOU for multiple data collection purposes.</p> <p>FTF will share and discuss the MOU with tribes to determine if entering into an MOU is appropriate and beneficial for all or some of the data collection purpose.</p> <p>FTF will meet with tribal leaders to understand what data they are interested in.</p>	<p>The MOU was completed and shared with regional directors.</p> <p>Whenever possible and appropriate, regional directors are having discussions with tribal leaders about the MOU.</p> <p>FTF will continue meeting with tribal leaders to understand their priorities and to share the data available for the region, discuss other data that may be helpful in understanding the needs of children and the resources that exist to support their health and learning.</p>